
A Claimant's Guide
to the
Medical Claims
Conciliation Panel

The Medical Claims Conciliation Panel
Office of Administrative Hearings
Department of Commerce
and Consumer Affairs
State of Hawai`i

March 2004

Table of Contents

<i>1. What is the M CCP?</i>	<i>3</i>
<i>2. What is the purpose of the M CCP?</i>	<i>3</i>
<i>3. Can the M CCP be bypassed and a lawsuit filed directly in court?</i>	<i>3</i>
<i>4. Can a claim be filed the M CCP, but not to set a hearing date?</i>	<i>3</i>
<i>5. Who should file a claim?</i>	<i>3</i>
<i>6. What kinds of claims should not be filed with the M CCP?</i>	<i>3</i>
<i>7. How are claims filed with the M CCP, and is there a filing fee?</i>	<i>3</i>
<i>8. What happens to the filing fee?</i>	<i>4</i>
<i>9. What if a party cannot afford to pay the filing fee?</i>	<i>4</i>
<i>10. What happens if a party doesn't submit a filing fee or a request for waiver?</i>	<i>4</i>
<i>11. What happens to the Statute of Limitations when a claim is filed?</i>	<i>5</i>
<i>12. What happens after a claim is filed?</i>	<i>5</i>
<i>13. Who will be on the Panel?</i>	<i>5</i>
<i>14. How is the hearing conducted?</i>	<i>5</i>
<i>15. What kind of decision does the Panel render?</i>	<i>6</i>
<i>16. What about damages?</i>	<i>6</i>
<i>17. How does the Panel make its decision?</i>	<i>6</i>
<i>18. When do the parties receive the Panel's decision?</i>	<i>6</i>
<i>19. What if one or both parties disagree with the Panel's decision?</i>	<i>6</i>
<i>20. Do all M CCP claims have to be heard by a Panel?</i>	<i>6</i>
<i>21. Can a lawsuit be filed in court if the claim is not heard by a Panel?</i>	<i>7</i>
<i>22. Can a claim be withdrawn, or amended to dismiss or add parties?</i>	<i>7</i>
<i>23. How can documents or witnesses be subpoenaed?</i>	<i>7</i>
<i>24. Who must attend the M CCP hearing?</i>	<i>7</i>
<i>25. Are there other requirement before the hearing?</i>	<i>8</i>
<i>26. Does the M CCP have any authority to impose sanctions?</i>	<i>8</i>
<i>27. Are there any other options to the M CCP?</i>	<i>9</i>
<i>28. Other considerations:</i>	<i>9</i>
<i>29. How to contact the M CCP:</i>	<i>10</i>
<i>Flow Chart of the M CCP Process</i>	<i>10</i>

1. *What is the M CCP?*

The Medical Claims Conciliation Panel ("M CCP") was established in 1976 by Hawai'i Revised Statutes ("HRS") §671-11, et seq., to hear and render non-binding advisory decisions of liability and damages for all potential medical tort claims in the State of Hawai'i.

2. *What is the purpose of the M CCP?*

The M CCP process is designed to help parties evaluate whether or not a case should be pursued further through the judicial system, and to help conciliate meritorious cases prior to the parties incurring the substantial expenses and time of extended litigation. The M CCP hearing provides an informal forum for both sides to test the strengths and weaknesses of their respective cases before an impartial Panel. Because of the composition and the collective experience of the Panel, the Panel's decision should reflect a likely outcome of the claim, if the same evidence were presented to a judge or a jury.

3. *Can the M CCP be bypassed and a lawsuit filed directly in court?*

No. Pursuant to HRS §671-11, before a lawsuit can be filed against a physician, osteopath (D.O.), podiatrist (DPM), or a hospital (or hospital staff), for medical negligence, the claim must first be filed with the M CCP.

4. *Can a claim be filed the M CCP, but not to set a hearing date?*

Generally, no. Pursuant to HRS §671-12, once a claim is filed, the M CCP will set the matter for hearing and send the notice of hearing to the parties involved.

5. *Who should file a claim?*

Anyone wishing to bring a lawsuit for medical malpractice against a physician, surgeon, osteopath (D. O.), podiatrist (D.P.M.), or hospital, licensed to practice or operate in the state of Hawaii, or an employee of these, must first file a claim with the M CCP before filing a lawsuit.

6. *What kinds of claims should not be filed with the M CCP?*

Generally, the jurisdiction of the M CCP does not cover claims against the following kinds of health care professionals: dentists (including oral surgeons), chiropractors, naturopaths, or psychologists. Claims against these kinds of health care professionals may therefore be filed directly with the appropriate courts. However, please remember that any employee of a health care provider may be subject to the M CCP's jurisdiction.

7. *How are claims filed with the M CCP, and is there a filing fee?*

EFFECTIVE SEPTEMBER 1, 2003, HRS §671-12.5, requires that claimants or claimants' attorneys have the claim evaluated by a qualified physician, or make a good faith effort to consult with a qualified physician before the claim can be filed with the M CCP. **Please**

read HRS Chapter 671, Part II - M CCP, attached to this Guide. Also attached to this Guide is a Certificate of Consultation form that should be submitted as part of the claim.

Claims may be submitted to the M CCP in the form of a letter to: **Medical Claims Conciliation Panel; P.O. Box 541; Honolulu, Hawai'i 96809.** For hand delivery, our street address is 335 Merchant Street, Suite 100; Honolulu, Hawai'i 96813. We are located in the King Kalakaua Building at the corner of Merchant and Richards Street, next door to the Downtown Branch of the Post Office.

Claim letters must include: (1) the complete names and addresses of the health care providers against whom the claim is made; and (2) a description of the alleged malpractice such as what, when, where, which health care provider(s) was (were) responsible for the alleged negligence, and the alleged negligent acts or omissions which the claimant believes fell below the standard of care. If the claim is not sufficiently clear, the respondents may ask for a more detailed statement of the claim.

In addition to filing a claim letter, all claimants identified in a claim, must ***each*** submit a filing fee of \$450.00 to cover the Panel's costs, at the time the claim is filed. Each respondent identified in the claim will also be required to submit a \$450.00 filing fee when the respondents file their responses to the claim.

8. *What happens to the filing fee?*

The filing fees submitted by the parties to a claim, are placed in an account to pay for the panel expenses. Additionally, \$50.00 from each filing fee is retained by the M CCP for administrative costs. After the Panel costs are paid for and the administrative fee retained, any remaining balances are returned to the parties on a proportionate basis.

9. *What if a party cannot afford to pay the filing fee?*

If any party cannot afford to pay the required filing fee, the party may submit a request to waive the filing fees. The M CCP utilizes the same financial guidelines used by the courts in determining whether a party is qualified to have judicial costs waived. The request to waive the filing fee must be filed with the claim letter. The request to waive the filing fee is reviewed by the Director of the Department of Commerce and Consumer Affairs, and the Director will make the final decision as to whether the filing fee should be waived. The person requesting the waiver will be informed of the Director's decision. The Ex Parte Motion to Waive of Filing Fees form is available from the M CCP, and may be filed with the M CCP and we will forward the request to the Director.

10. *What happens if a party doesn't submit a filing fee or a request for waiver?*

If a claim is submitted to the M CCP without the required filing or a request to waive the filing fee, the claim will not be accepted for filing. The rejection of a claim for filing with the M CCP also means that the applicable statute of limitations is not tolled. (See No. 11, below).

11. *What happens to the Statute of Limitations when a claim is filed?*

Pursuant to HRS §671-18, once a claim is filed with the M CCP, the applicable statute of limitations is tolled for 60 days following the mailing of the Panel decision, **or** for a maximum of 12 months from the filing of the claim, **whichever occurs first**.

12. *What happens after a claim is filed?*

After the claim is filed, we will process and log the claim, schedule a date for the hearing on the claim, and send notices to the parties informing the parties of the date of the hearing, and the deadlines for submitting required documents to the M CCP. Generally the hearing takes place within four to six months from the time we process the claim. In some circumstances, we may be able to expedite the processing of a claim, particularly in cases involving ongoing serious medical conditions or complications.

13. *Who will be on the Panel?*

Panels consist of three members: a chairperson, an attorney, and a doctor, selected pursuant to HRS §671-11. The chairperson is appointed the Director of DCCA from a list of individuals who are familiar with and experienced in the personal injury claims settlement process, and is generally an attorney. However, there are a number of eligible chairpersons who are not attorneys. The Chairperson selects the panel attorney member and the physician panel member. The physician member of the Panel is generally chosen from the same specialty as the health care provider named in the claim. If several health care providers are named in the claim, the Panel physician chosen will be from a specialty that can best evaluate the case.

14. *How is the hearing conducted?*

The M CCP hearings are less formal than judicial proceedings: the judicial rules of evidence are not strictly applied, but may be used as guidelines for purposes of relevancy. However, M CCP hearings are structured and are conducted with some degree of formality.

In M CCP cases, the claimant must prove by a preponderance of the evidence (more than 50%) that the respondent health care provider(s) breached of the applicable standard of care.

Typically, the Panel first asks for opening statements from all parties. After the opening statements, the claimant will have an opportunity to present claimant's case.

Following the presentation by the claimant, the defense puts on its case. Next, the Panel generally asks for brief closing arguments, and following that, the hearing is generally adjourned. We say generally, because some Panels choose to split the hearing so that evidence on liability is presented first, followed by a recess in which the Panel comes to a decision regarding liability. They then reconvene the hearing to hear evidence on damages.

15. *What kind of decision does the Panel render?*

The Panel renders a written decision, signed by all Panel members, either of “actionable negligence” or “no actionable negligence.” A Panel member may also render a dissenting opinion. Sometimes the dissenting Panel member will attach the dissenting opinion to the decision, while at other times, the dissenting Panel member simply notes the dissent on the decision. The actual wording of the decision, is prescribed by HRS §671-15.

16. *What about damages?*

When Panels render a decision of actionable negligence, they also make a suggested damage award. Therefore, be prepared to present evidence on damages at the hearing.

A few of the Panels (and by no means the majority), split the hearing, hearing the liability issue first, and then, if liability is found, hearing the evidence on damages. In cases such as these, generally the Panel will call a short recess (of approximately 30 minutes) to decide the liability issue. After the short recess, they reconvene the hearing, announce their decision as to liability and take evidence on damages.

17. *How does the Panel make its decision?*

The Panel bases its decision on evidence presented by parties before the hearing, such as medical records and prehearing statements, and on evidence presented at the hearing itself, including expert testimony, exhibits, and evidence regarding damages.

18. *When do the parties receive the Panel's decision?*

The decision will be mailed to the parties no later than thirty days following the completion of the hearing, pursuant to HRS §671-15.

19. *What if one or both parties disagree with the Panel's decision?*

Because the decisions of the Panel are only advisory and non-binding on the parties, after the M CCP hearing has been completed, the parties are may pursue their cases through the judicial system. However, pursuant to HRS §671-16, before a lawsuit based upon the claim can be filed in court, a party rejecting the Panel's decision must file a written rejection with the M CCP.

20. *Do all M CCP claims have to be heard by a Panel?*

Generally, yes. Pursuant to HRS §671-12, the M CCP must set a hearing date for all cases filed. There are a small number of cases in which all of the parties agree to have the hearing taken off the hearings calendar.

A typical reason for this request occurs when the claimant's attorney withdraws as counsel for a case leaving the claimant pro se. Generally in these cases the claimant pro se then requests additional time to find other counsel. If the claimant is unsuccessful in finding new counsel, the case sometimes remains inactive at the claimant's request for the remainder

of the 12 month period. If the defense wishes to proceed, however, the M CCP will reschedule the case for hearing.

Additionally, under HRS §671-16.6 the claim may be submitted to an alternative dispute resolution provider, upon the written agreement of all of the parties to the claim and with the written approval of the Director of DCCA. ***Please read HRS Chapter 671, Part II - M CCP, attached to this Guide***

21. Can a lawsuit be filed in court if the claim is not heard by a Panel?

In very unusual situations, there have been some cases that do not proceed to hearing, either at the request of both parties, or for some other procedural reason. However, because the applicable the M CCP will close its files on the matters after 12 months from the filing date of the claim. The M CCP then advises parties that the 12 months have elapsed, that any applicable statute of limitations has resumed running, and that parties are then free to file in court.

22. Can a claim be withdrawn, or amended to dismiss or add parties?

The M CCP can only accept only written withdrawals of claims and amendments to original claims. To withdraw a claim, simply write the M CCP advising us of your wish to withdraw the claim

Similarly, if you wish to amend your claim to add additional respondents or dismiss certain health care providers from your claim prior to the hearing, you must submit your written request to the M CCP.

23. How can documents or witnesses be subpoenaed?

The Panel and the M CCP have the authority to subpoena documentary evidence and the appearance and testimony of witnesses, pursuant to HRS §671-13. In order to have subpoenas issued, the requesting party is required to follow the language of HRS §671-13, since that section also limits discovery by parties to medical records and notes kept in connection with the practice of medicine.

Usually, the claimant or the claimant's attorney does not need to subpoena the claimant's medical records. Generally, a written request to the health care provider is sufficient. Once the claim is filed with the M CCP and a defense attorney is assigned to the case, the defense counsel may be willing to assist the claimant in obtaining the records, as a professional courtesy. The M CCP staff can also assist.

On the other hand, if a party requests the M CCP to issue a subpoena, the requesting party is responsible for: 1) preparing (filling out) the subpoena; 2) having the subpoenaed served; and 3) any other appearance fees and costs related to the production of the documents. Generally, it is unnecessary to subpoena the health care provider(s) named in your claim to appear at the hearing, because HRS §671-14 requires their presence at the hearing, unless excused by the Panel. Please let us know if you would like to receive additional information regarding the preparation and service of subpoenas.

24. Who must attend the M CCP hearing?

HRS §671-14 requires that both claimant and health care provider appear at the hearing, along with their counsel, if any. Claimant's attorneys sometimes ask if their client may be excused if the client no longer lives in this state. Every Panel makes that decision on a case by case basis. Generally, the Panel requires claimants and health care provider(s) to be present at the hearing, even if they no longer reside in the state. Unlike court, the purpose of the MCCP Panel program is conciliation and it is difficult to conciliate anything with an empty chair.

However, HRS §671-14 does provide the Panel with the authority to excuse parties from attendance at the hearing and you may make such a request of the Panel in advance of the hearing.

25. Are there other requirement before the hearing?

After the claim is processed, the MCCP will advise the parties in writing of the deadlines to submit the relevant medical records and the prehearing statements. A sample format for the prehearing statement is also sent to the parties.

Medical Records: We require that the claimant submit four paginated sets of the claimant's relevant medical records, within 20 days after the Notice of Claim is sent to the parties. If there are extensive medical records, it may be advisable for a claimant to start requesting and copying those records when the claimant files the claim, if not sooner. Generally, there should be very few, if any problems in a claimant obtaining the claimant's own medical records from the health care provider. If any problems are encountered, a phone call to opposing counsel or to the MCCP, generally takes care of the problem. If a party would like to have the medical records returned, the MCCP can return 3 of the 4 sets, if the request is made to the MCCP no later than the morning of the hearing.

Prehearing Statement: Approximately 5 to 6 weeks prior to the hearing, we require the parties to submit 4 sets of their prehearing statements (an original plus three additional copies for a total of four) to the MCCP. In addition, the parties are required to exchange prehearing statements. The MCCP supplies a sample format for the claimant's and respondent's prehearing statements.

26. Does the MCCP have any authority to impose sanctions?

Yes. The 1993 Legislature passed a bill giving the MCCP power to assess costs of the hearing, including the costs of expert witnesses and Panel stipends, to a party who does not cooperate with the MCCP. For examples of non-cooperation, see HRS §671-19. If the party does not agree with the assessment of costs, the party may appeal the assessment to circuit court.

27. *Are there any other options to the M CCP?*

Yes. Act 211, 2003 Session Laws of Hawai'i, authorizes the parties involved in a M CCP claim to submit the claim to an alternative dispute resolution provider that is selected by all of the parties.

28. *Other considerations:*

A. Bring the claim against the correct health care provider(s). One of the most frequent errors made by attorneys for claimants is assuming that doctors are employees of a hospital, only to realize at the hearing that they have sued the wrong health care provider. The claimant or the claimant's attorney then has to go back to step one and file a new claim against the correct health care provider. This situation can be avoided by first doing a search of the DCCA corporate and professional licensing records of the health care provider(s)'s personal and professional corporate status.

If a claim is filed against the wrong health care provider, the statute of limitations could expire prior to the filing of a second claim against the correct health care provider(s)—a situation for which the M CCP has no remedy. Obviously, too, filing a second claim regarding the same incident is a waste of time and resources.

B. Get help if you need it. Keep in mind that the medical malpractice defense counsel in Hawaii are specialists in this highly technical field and are usually very prepared when they come to M CCP hearings, including bringing expert testimony either in person, by letter, or by telephone. Therefore, if the claimant is relatively inexperienced in this highly technical field, the claimant might consider consulting with an expert in the field. This can be done by retaining counsel or by consultation with a medical-legal consultant.

C. Present expert testimony. It is the claimant's responsibility to show that the health care provider(s) care or conduct fell below the standard of care, and the claimant must therefore present evidence to show what is the standard of care, that the standard of care has been breached, and that this breach is the proximate cause of the injury to the claimant.

Although there are expenses relating to retaining expert witnesses, the claimant must decide whether or not to spend the money at the M CCP level in the hope of resolving the claim at the M CCP level, or retain an expert for subsequent judicial proceedings. At the M CCP hearings, claimants have presented expert testimony by letter, telephone, or in person. (Please note that if a claimant plans to present expert testimony by telephone, the Panel and the M CCP must be informed in advance since different arrangements must then be made with the cooperation of the attorneys and the Panel to provide a room with a conference telephone.)

29. *How to contact the M CCP:*

Medical Claims Conciliation Panel
Office of Administrative Hearings
Department of Commerce and Consumer Affairs
335 Merchant Street, Suite 100
Honolulu, Hawai'i 96813

Telephone: (808) 586-2823
Fax: (808) 586-3097
E-mail: mccp@dcca.hawaii.gov

INDIVIDUALS WITH SPECIAL NEEDS

Individuals who may require special accommodations for the hearing (e.g. sign language interpreter, large print, taped materials, etc.), are invited to call the Office of Administrative Hearings at 586-2828 at least five (5) days in advance of the hearing.

This publication can be made available for individuals with special needs in Braille, large print, or audio tape. Please submit your request to the Medical Claims Conciliation Panel at 586-2823.

Flowchart of the MCCP Process

